

SARAH E. HARRINGTON  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

STEPHANIE M. HINDS (CABN 154284)  
Acting United States Attorney

SARA WINSLOW (DCBN 457643)  
Chief, Civil Division

BENJAMIN WOLINSKY (CABN 305410)  
SHIWON CHOE (CABN 320041)  
Assistant United States Attorneys

450 Golden Gate Avenue, Box 36055  
San Francisco, California 94102-3495  
Telephone: (415) 436-7200  
Facsimile: (415) 436-6748  
benjamin.wolinsky@usdoj.gov  
shiwon.choe@usdoj.gov

JAMIE ANN YAVELBERG  
PATRICIA L. HANOWER  
ARTHUR S. DI DIO  
GARY R. DYAL  
LAURIE A. OBEREMBT  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
Commercial Litigation Branch

Attorneys for the United States of America

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
RONDA OSINEK,

Plaintiff,

v.

KAISER PERMANENTE,

Defendant.

) Case No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC

) **UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE**  
) **MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;**  
) ~~**PROPOSED**~~ **ORDER**

) **FILED UNDER SEAL**

(captions continued on next page)

1 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
2 NASER AREFI, AJITH KUMAR, and PRIME  
HEALTHCARE SERVICES,

3 Plaintiffs,

4 v.

5 KAISER FOUNDATION HEALTH PLAN,  
6 INC., et al.,

7 Defendants.

) Case No. 3:16-cv-01558-EMC

) **UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE**  
) **MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;**  
) ~~**[PROPOSED]**~~ **ORDER**

) **FILED UNDER SEAL**

8 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
9 MARCIA STEIN AND RODOLFO BONE,

10 Plaintiffs,

11 v.

12 KAISER FOUNDATION HEALTH PLAN,  
13 INC., et al.,

14 Defendants.

) Case No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC

) **UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE**  
) **MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;**  
) ~~**[PROPOSED]**~~ **ORDER**

) **FILED UNDER SEAL**

15 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and STATE  
16 OF CALIFORNIA ex rel. GLORYANNE  
17 BRYANT and VICTORIA M. HERNANDEZ,

18 Plaintiffs,

19 v.

20 KAISER PERMANENTE, INC., et al.,

21 Defendants.

) Case No. 3:18-cv-01347-EMC

) **UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE**  
) **MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;**  
) ~~**[PROPOSED]**~~ **ORDER**

) **FILED UNDER SEAL**

22 (captions continued on next page)

1 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and STATE )  
2 OF CALIFORNIA ex rel. MICHAEL )  
3 BICOCCA, )  
4 Plaintiff, )  
5 v. )  
6 PERMANENTE MEDICAL GROUP, INC., et )  
7 al., )  
8 Defendants. )

---

Case No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC

**UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE  
MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;  
~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

8 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel. )  
9 JAMES M. TAYLOR, )  
10 Plaintiff, )  
11 v. )  
12 KAISER PERMANENTE, INC., et al., )  
13 Defendants. )

---

Case No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC

**UNITED STATES' UNOPPOSED EX PARTE  
MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES;  
~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

## INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a), the United States respectfully requests that the Court consolidate the following six qui tam actions, which are all designated as related:

1. *United States ex rel. Osinek v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);
2. *United States ex rel. Arefi v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-01558-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);
3. *United States ex rel. Stein v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);
4. *United States ex rel. Bryant v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:18-cv-1347-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);
5. *United States ex rel. Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL); and
6. *United States ex rel. Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL).

The United States respectfully submits that consolidation is warranted because these six qui tam actions are brought against common defendants — related Kaiser Permanente (“Kaiser”) entities — and involve common questions of fact and law, and because consolidation will significantly promote judicial economy.

This motion is being filed under seal because the six qui tam actions are currently sealed pursuant to the False Claims Act (“FCA”), 31 U.S.C. § 3729–33. Due to the sealed nature of all six cases and because Defendants have not yet been served in these cases, this notice is not being served on Defendants. The United States has conferred with Relators in all six cases, and none of the Relators opposes this motion.

## DISCUSSION

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a) provides that “[i]f actions before the court involve a common question of law or fact, the court may . . . consolidate the actions[.]”

“[A] district court has broad discretion under [Rule 42(a)] to consolidate cases pending in the

1 same district.” *Investors Research Co. v. U.S. Dist. Ct.*, 877 F.2d 777, 777 (9th Cir. 1989). In  
2 determining whether or not to consolidate cases, the court should “weigh the interest of judicial  
3 convenience against the potential for delay, confusion and prejudice.” *Zhu v. UCBH Holdings, Inc.*, 682  
4 F. Supp. 2d 1049, 1052 (N.D. Cal. 2010). “[T]ypically, consolidation is favored.” *Tse v. Apple, Inc.*,  
5 No. C 12-0265, 2013 WL 451639, at \*3 (N.D. Cal. Feb. 5, 2013).

6 The six qui tam actions each raise claims under the FCA to recover damages to the government  
7 due to allegedly fraudulent conduct of Kaiser Permanente, a health care consortium headquartered in  
8 Oakland, California. The six actions each allege that Kaiser submitted claims to the Medicare  
9 Advantage Program, also known as Medicare Part C, for risk-adjustment payments for diagnoses that its  
10 patients did not actually have and/or that were not actually addressed by the treating physician during a  
11 patient encounter as required by Medicare billing rules. The United States is the real party in interest in  
12 all six actions, the defendants are the same or related Kaiser entities in all six actions, and the six actions  
13 involve common questions of fact and law. Because of their commonality, the six actions likely will  
14 involve the same or similar discovery and motions practice and, if the actions proceed to trial, the same  
15 or similar witnesses, evidence, and exhibits. In light of the commonality between the six actions,  
16 consolidating the actions will conserve judicial resources and promote the efficient conduct and  
17 determination of the actions.

## 18 CONCLUSION

19 The United States respectfully requests that the Court consolidate the *Osinek, Arefi, Stein,*  
20 *Bryant, Bicocca,* and *Taylor* actions. A proposed order is attached.

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

28 //

1 DATED: June 11, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

2 SARAH E. HARRINGTON  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

3 STEPHANIE M. HINDS  
4 Acting United States Attorney

5 *s/Shiwon Choe*

6 BENJAMIN WOLINSKY  
SHIWON CHOE  
Assistant United States Attorneys

7 JAMIE ANN YAVELBERG  
8 PATRICIA L. HANOWER  
9 ARTHUR S. DI DIO  
GARY R. DYAL  
LAURIE A. OBEREMBT  
10 United States Department of Justice  
11 Civil Division  
Commercial Litigation Branch

12 Attorneys for the United States

1 **~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER**


2 The Court, having considered the United States of America's Unopposed Ex Parte Motion to  
3 Consolidate Cases, hereby orders that the following actions shall be consolidated for all purposes:

- 4 1. *United States ex rel. Osinek v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC (N.D. Cal.)  
5 (UNDER SEAL);  
6 2. *United States ex rel. Arefi v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-01558-  
7 EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);  
8 3. *United States ex rel. Stein v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-05337-  
9 EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL);  
10 4. *United States ex rel. Bryant v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:18-cv-1347-EMC (N.D. Cal.)  
11 (UNDER SEAL);  
12 5. *United States ex rel. Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-  
13 EMC (N.D. Cal.) (UNDER SEAL); and  
14 6. *United States ex rel. Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.)  
15 (UNDER SEAL).

16 The Parties shall file all future pleadings and other filings in the consolidated actions on the  
17 docket in Case No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC (N.D. Cal.).

18 IT IS SO ORDERED.

19  
20 DATED: June 25, 2021

21   
22 HON. EDWARD M. CHEN  
23 United States District Judge  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28